Transnational food migration and the internalization of food consumption.

Ethnic cuisine in West Germany

Maren Möhring

In the field of food, globalization has often been discussed as an internationalization of foods and food consumption habits. Besides quantitative and qualitative adaptations in food consumption it is, above all, the growing importance of "foreign", imported foods and the decreasing relevance of regional foods for local markets that is considered a characteristic of internationalization.[i] Regionalization, nationalization, internationalization and globalization, however, are not separate phenomena, succeeding one another, but, I would argue, in a sense *parallel* and interacting processes. From a historical perspective, the emergence of distinct national as well as regional cuisines is an effect of what we today call globalization. In most European countries, national cuisines were invented in the 19th century, during the first phase of globalization and the decisive stages of nation-building.[ii] National cuisines tied together the manifold regional and local cuisines which nevertheless did not disappear. In Germany, a national cuisine, claiming simplicity and naturalness, was constructed mainly to distinguish it from the internationally dominant and refined French cuisine.[iii] Whereas the emergence of national cuisines in the 19th century was an answer to intensified international contacts and political, economic as well as cultural competition, the immense diversification of cuisines today can be interpreted as an answer to global processes of generic standardization, epitomized in the idea of a McDonaldization of food culture.[iv] Since the 1990s, the idea of a global homogenization of foods and food consumption patterns has been discussed and criticized for underestimating "the local" and its complex connections with "the global". Roland Robertson's concept of 'glocalization'[v] tries to grasp this mutual constitution of "the local" and "the global", enabling descriptions of local adaptations of globally traded goods and their social and cultural re-coding.[vi]

My study of ethnic restaurants in West Germany addresses similar processes, focussing on transnational food migration and thus combining research on consumerism and migration to post-war Germany. When I speak of food migration, I am not aiming primarily at the function of food as an 'agent of memory'[vii] and the changes in food habits occurring within the new homes of migrants. Analyzing the ethnic restaurant entails a focus on the *public* production and consumption of ethnic

food, i.e. the emergence of migrant cuisines in the market-place and their effects on the food consumption patterns of the non-migrant population.

The growing popularity of eating out, and eating out in ethnic restaurants in particular, as a social and cultural practice will be outlined in the first part of this paper, followed by a chapter on the spread of ethnic restaurants and snack-bars in West Germany. Ethnic cuisine, however, did not only become more and more important in the restaurant sector, it also changed home cooking, an aspect which will be discussed in the third part of this paper. The last chapter deals with the cultural meanings surrounding ethnic food, focussing on the political dimension of ethnicized commodities.

1. Eating Out

The restaurant, i.e. an establishment where ready-made eatables and drinks are not only bought, but also consumed and where – in contrast to traditional inns – the patrons choose their meals from a menu card and eat them at separate tables,[viii] is a genuinely modern phenomenon. Restaurants originated in Paris at the end of the 18th century[ix] and developed relatively late in Germany, their real spread only beginning in the 1870s and their full establishment dating to the years just before the First World War.[x] The war led to a decline in the number of restaurants, partly compensated for in the interwar years.[xi] Because of the growing distance between home and working-place in urban areas, the reduction of time for lunch breaks and the increasing percentage of women joining the workforce,[xii] more and more people became dependent on public eateries offering lunch. Besides this, in the course of the 20th century, eating out has become an essential part of leisure time activities.

Since the 1950s and especially since the 1960s, an increasing proportion of household food expenditure has been devoted to eating out, not only in Germany, but in all Western countries and Japan. In 1978, ca. 50 per cent of the German population had lunch or dinner outside their homes, 91,2 per cent of them went to restaurants and snack-bars, 20,7 per cent (also) to canteens. Men ate more often in canteens than women who went to restaurants more frequently.[xiii] In 1983, on average, every household had seven, in 1988 eight meals per month in a restaurant, whereas in 1993 the number dropped to 5,7 (in the new *Bundesländer* only 4,8 meals were eaten outside the home in 1993). From 1993 to 1998, however, the expenditure for individually consumed food outside the home nearly doubled.[xiv] Whereas in 1983 the main meals were mostly eaten in restaurants (ca. 80 per cent), the smaller meals

were bought in snack-bars (ca. 70 per cent).[xv] In the year 2000, on the average, every German spent nearly 42 German Marks for taking meals outside the home three times per week, small snack-bars being a little more popular than restaurants.[xvi] Take-away meals have become more and more popular in recent years, a trend that had reached Britain a little earlier. From 1975 to 1984, the number of take-away meals in the UK rose from 14 to 27 per cent of all meals eaten.[xvii]

Though eating out is popular all over Europe, the differences between the European countries are significant. Consumers in Scandinavia generally eat out less often than their counterparts in Western Europe, though this practice is significantly more popular in Sweden than in Norway. Today, ca. 10 per cent of the Norwegian population never go to a restaurant, while about 60 per cent eat out in a restaurant three to eleven times a year, 35 per cent once a month and only 12 per cent once a week.[xviii] While the place of residence and income can be considered material factors influencing the decision to eat out,[xix] age and education are the main cultural factors. Like in other European countries, the typical restaurant guest in Norway is young and/or highly educated and 'definitely urban'.[xx] This holds true even more when visiting *ethnic* restaurants is concerned.[xxi] In Germany, more than 40 per cent of the guests of ethnic restaurants are under the age of 35, compared to less than 30 per cent in German restaurants.[xxii]

Since the 1980s, eating out in *ethnic* restaurants and snack-bars has become 'one of the hottest segments of the food service industry'.[xxiii] The ethnic food market in France, Germany, Italy, Spain and Britain grew to 924 million pounds in 1997, the UK having the largest ethnic food market in Europe accounting for two-thirds of the sales figures.[xxiv] British surveys demonstrate that consumption of ethnic foods, above all Indian and Chinese, have risen steadily since 1995, albeit major regional differences have to be taken into account, expenditure being highest in London and much lower in Northern England and Scotland.[xxv]

Eating out in an ethnic restaurant is a social and cultural practice that has often been described as a 'substitute for travel'.[xxvi] Whereas for the migrant restaurateur and the migrant patron the ethnic restaurant might represent some form of (diasporic) "home", for the other guests it is associated with vacation and/or the exotic. Meeting the expectations of the non-migrant patrons, many ethnic restaurants choose their style of furniture and decoration according to a specific 'architecture of desire',[xxvii] underlining the importance of aestheticization and the imagination in the act of dining out as a modern form of entertainment.

It is not only the touristic experience of an increasing part of the population,[xxviii] but also the mostly moderate prizes[xxix] and informality of many ethnic restaurants that have been the decisive factors for the success of these enterprises. But what is an ethnic restaurant? Wilbur Zelinsky defines it as follows: A 'self-consciously ethnic restaurant will show its colors in one of three places: in its name, in its inclusion under an ethnic heading in a special section of the telephone directory, or by listing the specialties of the house in a display ad'.[xxx]

Since the distinction of German and foreign food, of here and there, is anything but self-evident, the processes of constructing these placings need to be explored, thus questioning and historicizing the whole concept of ethnic restaurant and ethnic cuisine. In Germany, the term "ausländische Gastronomie" is used for "ethnic cuisine" and, at least from 1950 to 1980, the ethnic restaurant was called *ausländisches Spezialitätenrestaurant* (restaurant offering foreign specialties), thus stressing the food's origin in a foreign country. At the same time, German cuisine was not considered as an ethnic cuisine among others, but was left ethnically unmarked. Whereas in today's telephone directories we sometimes find headings announcing German cuisine, this is a new development, due to the understanding that German cuisine forms (just) one part of a multicultural gastronomic landscape. Before the 1990s, German cuisine was categorized according to the kind of dishes the restaurant specialized on (e.g., fish restaurants) or, and this holds true for most of the German restaurants, classified as *(gut)bürgerlich*, i.e. both home-style and middle-class, thus pointing to the place's claimed social status – a form of social differentiation that is lost when a restaurant is simply labelled as "foreign". The adjective *bürgerlich* was and sometimes still is used as a synonym for "German (cuisine)". This becomes apparent in an article on "foreign" cuisine, published in the *Leverkusener Anzeiger*, the local newspaper of the city of Leverkusen near Cologne, in July 1980. Under the headline 'Türken und Thais rühren im Küchentopf' (Turks and Thai stir in the cooking pot) the author emphasizes that foreign restaurateurs 'speak German and cook foreign (but also *bürgerliche*) dishes',[xxxi] meaning that they offer German food, too. Especially in the early stage of ethnic cuisine in post-war Germany, the menus often combined foreign and German dishes, presenting them next to each other, as the 1965 menu of a Greek restaurant in Munich demonstrates which offers Greek 'specialties' as well as 'Wurstsalat' (fig. 1). In practice, the dishes were often adapted to each other or fused, bringing forth a new, transnational cuisine.[xxxii]

Taking into account the 'heterotopic effect' of migrant cuisines,[xxxiii] the ethnic restaurant has to be conceptualized as a local place of food consumption, the locality of which is transnational from the outset. Whereas the collective term *Lokal* in German refers to any kind of eatery or bar (not only to the neighbourhood pub), the ethnic *Lokal* could be called a *Trans-Lokalität*. Here, transnational networks and intercultural transfers of foodstuffs, technologies and information can be analyzed within the sphere of everyday life. The social actors – migrant and non-migrant owners of the restaurant, cooks, waiters, (illegal) kitchen workers as well as migrant and non-migrant patrons – all participate in the transnational space of the ethnic restaurant, though with differing investments.[xxxiv] It is precisely this transnational setting which makes the ethnic restaurant a predestined place – like cookbooks –, for (re-) inventing national, ethnic and regional cuisines.[xxxv] Here, certain dishes, formerly typical only for one region or another, are stylized in such a way that they become the embodiment of national cuisines. Which dishes are selected depends on the specific local conditions, the availability of the necessary ingredients as well as the likes and dislikes of the non-migrant population frequenting the restaurant. The construction of national dishes therefore not only takes place within a national, but within a transnational framework, with feed-back effects on the "homeland". Pizza is one of the most prominent examples for these processes: In Italy, pizza had been a common food only in Naples;[xxxvi] its international career started in the US where migrants from southern Italy transformed the pizza in several ways to meet American tastes – and were extremely successful with their invention. In Germany, pizza became relatively wide-known during the years of occupation when American soldiers introduced it to German prisoners of war[xxxvii] as well as to civilians. In the 1960s and 1970s, pizzerias spread all over Germany. They were tremendously successful as they offered modestly priced dishes and a less formal, child-friendly atmosphere[xxxviii] and made German tourists also want their pizza when they stayed in Italy. Last but not least touristic considerations led to the establishment of pizzerias in the whole of Italy.

2. The spread of ethnic restaurants in West Germany

It was at the end of the 19th century that the demand for new types of reasonably priced eateries emerged; early forms of convenience restaurants like *Aschinger* in Berlin opened up where you could get a quick and inexpensive lunch. During periods of food rationing, i.e. the two world wars, scarce food could be eaten there,

making public eateries an indispensable part of city life.[xxxix] Whereas Aschinger offered German or, to be more precise, Bavarian cuisine, restaurants with "foreign" cuisine were rare in the German *Kaiserreich*. There existed a few Italian restaurants in big cities like Berlin, and in seaports like Hamburg, we find a number of Chinese restaurants,[xl] but these places were exceptions rather than the rule. All in all, it was the Italian cuisine that functioned as a kind of door-opener for other ethnic cuisines, itself predated by the success of Italian ice cream parlors which spread all over middle and Western Europe in the late 19th and early 20th centuries.[xli] At this time, Germany already was the prime importer of Italian products,[xlii] especially food of which cheese and rice were the most asked-for goods. The German-Italian food trade played a pivotal role during the "Third Reich",[xliii] and although national socialist policy was opposed to "foreign" influences, including cuisines, and instead propagated German cookery, Germany relied upon the food imports of the allied axis power.

Even though there is some continuity of restaurants offering "foreign" cuisine through-out the 20th century, a noteworthy spread of ethnic cuisine has only taken place in post-war West Germany. Whereas ethnic restaurants had been an almost exclusively metropolitan phenomenon before the Second World War, in the 1960s and 1970s the picture started to change. Many restaurants, most of them offering Mediterranean cuisine, were established by immigrants, some of them former "guest-workers" (*Gastarbeiter*), i.e. immigrants who had been recruited on the basis of contract labor in the years 1955 to 1974.[xliv] Many of the migrants starting a restaurant or snack-bar had working experience as waiters or waitresses, cooks or kitchen helpers; 17.000 "guest-workers" had explicitly been hired for work in German catering.[xlv] The spread of ethnic restaurants which started in the 1960s accelerated in the 1970s and 1980s: Within the period 1975 to 1985, the number of ethnic restaurants doubled from ca. 20.000 to ca. 40.000; 1985 every fourth restaurant was run by a non-German owner.[xlvi] In 1992, of the 55.000 foreign restaurateurs in Germany approximately 18.000 were Italian; the second biggest group were the Turkish restaurateurs.[xlvii] Today, there are about 7.000 Italian restaurants and ca. 9.000 pizzerias in Germany.[xlviii]

The data I collected for the cities of Cologne and Leverkusen shows that a considerable spread of ethnic restaurants took place no earlier than the late 1960s. While in 1950 only three ethnic restaurants existed in Cologne – one of them Italian, the other two Chinese –, in 1955 there were five, in 1960 eleven, in 1968 fourteen. It

was only in 1973 that the number of ethnic restaurants had increased to 62.[xlix] In Leverkusen in 1977, 76 of the 445 restaurants were ethnic restaurants run by foreign residents, mainly from Italy, Yugoslavia, Greece and China.[l] Except for the food offered in so-called *China-Restaurants*, a term only known in Germany and suggesting that these eateries not only offer Chinese food, but an experience of a miniature China,[li] other non-European cuisines were not available in Germany – in marked contrast to the UK. Whereas in London Indian restaurants were already fashionable in the 1950s,[lii] in Germany Indian cuisine was considered absolutely exotic. In 1951, a German businessman, living in India, suggested to the Chamber of Commerce in Cologne that one or more of the city's hotels should offer Indian food, prepared by an Indian cook, so that businessmen from India were no longer forced to stay in London when travelling around Europe. Employing an Indian cook, however, was beyond the imagination of Cologne restaurant managers in the early 1950s: 'Ein solcher Vorschlag ist natürlich für uns unannehmbar' (Such a proposal is, of course, unacceptable for us).[liii]

The increasing number of migrants opening up restaurants soon alarmed German restaurateurs. In 1977 the director of the Northern Rhenish association of the restaurant and hotel business proclaimed that the restaurant scene in Leverkusen was certainly not in foreign hand ('in fremder Hand'), but that nevertheless a huge number of non-German businesses existed giving rise to "legitimate fears". According to him, it was no longer guaranteed that the city's authorities were able to control the adherence to German laws and regulations. The authorities, however, reacted to this intervention in a very reserved way, emphasizing that there was no problem at all with the supervision of the restaurants in Leverkusen, whether they were run by German or non-German owners.[liv]

The migrant businesses were often situated in urban areas like decaying inner cities or red-light districts unalluring to German entrepreneurs. These areas were not suitable for a *gutbürgerliches* (German) restaurant, but provided the ethnic restaurants with a new clientele: besides other migrants especially (young) people indulging in night-life activities were attracted to these eating-places where full meals were served at a moderate prize and late at night when "traditional" restaurants had already shut their doors. Opening up a restaurant in a non-migrant residence area was not at all an easy task, especially for immigrant entrepreneurs, I would argue. Archival records demonstrate that the (German) neighbours of

planned as well as existing ethnic restaurants often objected to the establishment or maintenance of these places, mostly on the grounds of being disturbed by noise.[lv]

Despite the sometimes openly hostile atmosphere, many migrants chose to open up their own business. What were the reasons for this decision? In the 1970s, the economic restructuring in the aftermath of the oil-crisis affected immigrants in particular; the unemployment rates of foreign residents were disproportionately high. Since non-EU nationals, i.e. until the 1980s all "guest-workers" except for the Italians, were at risk of losing their residence permit when becoming dependent on social welfare (after the expiry of their eligibility for unemployment benefits), opening up your own business often was the only way to make a living in Germany, for oneself as well as for family members who came to Germany in the course of family reunification politics. Whereas the German government developed various measures to convince the "guest-workers" to return to their home countries, the migrants created jobs for themselves and their families, made their stay in Germany a permanent one and thereby successfully resisted the government's repatriation (*Rückführung*) campaigns. By becoming self-employed, many migrants also fulfilled their desire for independence, attaining control over their lives and escaping from at least some forms of institutional and everyday racism encountered at many working-places in Germany. When I explain the decision of migrants to become self-employed with (the risk of) unemployment, I am right in the middle of the discussions on ethnic economy, a concept dominating the field of research on immigrant self-employment. Whereas research on ethnic business in the US tends to stress the socio-economic chances and the success of self-employed immigrants, the European debate tends to see ethnic business as a reaction to discrimination on the labor market. In Germany, the job market is highly regulated and institutional barriers make access to the formal labor market difficult for migrants. Whereas in the US immigrant business has been supported by the ideology of free enterprise and the myth of the "self-made man," in Germany, an immigration country in denial with a migration regime based on rotation, ethnic business has a very different history[lvi] – a history still to be written.

Until 2005, migrants who had not resided in Germany for at least five or eight years needed straw men, i.e. figureheads, to establish themselves in business.[lvii] The precarious legal status of migrants and strong business regulations as the necessity of formal tests in your craft (*Deutsche Handwerksordnung*) has hindered and still hinders self-employment. Despite these restrictions, many migrants managed to start their

own business, mainly in the segment "small business". The largest part of the immigrant economy in Germany belongs to the food and especially the restaurant sector: 27 per cent of the foreign self-employed are involved in the field of catering, and another 15 per cent in the retail business.[lviii] The main reason for the higher propensity to enter these sectors is the comparatively low financial capital needed.[lix]

Grocery stores and restaurants belong to an unstable and labor-intensive sector,[lx] strongly affected by trade recession and thus with a high labor turnover rate. These characteristics are considered typical for what is classified as ethnic business. There are, according to Felicitas Hillmann, four main features that define an ethnic business: horizontal and vertical co-ethnic networks; the employment of mainly co-ethnic workers, often (unpaid) family members; a predominantly co-ethnic clientele; and co-ethnic suppliers (sub-contractors).[lxi] A business is labelled "ethnic" when belonging to an ethnic community influences socioeconomic decisions, when "ethnic solidarity" functions as a substantial resource.[lxii]

In contrast to other (ethnic) businesses, in restaurants the percentage of employees who do not belong to the family is considerably high; but these mostly co-national workers often have been recommended by friends or kin.[lxiii] Whereas the characteristics of an ethnic business hold true in the case of ethnic restaurants in Germany, these presumably specific qualities are also found in other small businesses not viewed as ethnic, namely in businesses where kinship networks and the unpaid work of family members are common features, too.[lxiv]

Another problematic aspect of the concept of ethnic business is the (sometimes) underlying essentialist notion of "ethnic communities." In many case studies dealing with ethnic economy, ethnic communities appear to be more or less homogenous and static, with clear-cut borders; differences within these imagined communities are often overlooked – as well as their transformation over time, an aspect that is especially relevant in the context of migration processes. Nevertheless, ethnicity[lxv] may, in historically specific situations and for a certain period, function as a resource that can be used economically. But instead of explaining socioeconomic or cultural processes with recourse to ethnicity, it is strategies of ethnicization and self-ethnicization that have to be taken into consideration, underlining the fluidity and variability of ethnicities. The whole debate on the so-called ethnic economy itself forms part of those discourses that have to be analyzed in a study on ethnic restaurants.

3. The internationalization of home cooking

According to a survey on eating-out preferences in Germany in 2003, 56 per cent of the respondents said that they liked foreign cuisine most. Almost 50 per cent preferred Italian restaurants, followed by Chinese and Greek restaurants (21 per cent resp. 18 per cent). French cuisine was named by only 2 per cent and Spanish cuisine by 1 per cent of the interviewed persons.[lxvi]

Foreign dishes also score high when food preferences at home are at stake. In Germany spaghetti have become the most popular home-cooked dish, Italian pasta and olive oil selling very well.[lxvii] This is a new trend; in the 1950s and 1960s German consumers preferred Italianized convenience food like *Maggi*'s canned ravioli or *Kraft*'s spaghetti "Miracoli".[lxviii] In his study on food consumption in Germany in the 1950s, Michael Wildt has analyzed the market research undertaken by *Maggi* and highlighted the following trends: a turn to more digestible food and the increasing popularity of international specialities in general and Italian specialities in particular.[lxix] *Maggi's* canned ravioli were tested in two German cities in summer 1957 and, because of their great success, introduced all over Germany only a year later. In autumn 1961 more than 75 per cent of German housewives interviewed by the Nuremberg *Gesellschaft für Konsumforschung*, undertaking research on consumer choices, knew of the new product.[lxx] Internationality and the fast food aspect were, according to Wildt, the two main elements for the success of canned ravioli.[lxxi]

Not only instant food promising internationality and modernity, however, was promoted in the 1950s. The cooking columns of women's magazines and *Hausfrauenblätter* (housewives' magazines) show an increasing interest in "foreign" cuisine. In the journal *Die kluge Hausfrau* (The wise housewife), edited by *Edeka,* an association of the retail business, with an average circulation of one million copies in the mid-50s,[lxxii] the first Italian recipe was published in December 1950, presenting an Italian salad.[lxxiii] The Italian salad is a standard recipe that is included in almost all cookbooks of the 1950s to 1980s and is not only found in cookery books dedicated to "international specialities".[lxxiv] The Italian salad in *Die kluge Hausfrau* was meant for the New Year's Eve buffet,[lxxv] demonstrating that parties, in contrast to highly tradition-bound festive meals, e.g. on Christmas, are a field where a more experimental style of cooking is appreciated.[lxxvi]

Certain vegetables, typical of Mediterranean cuisines, like eggplants and zucchini, were not easily available on the German market. Bedriye Furtina who had come from Turkey to Germany in 1959 recollects:

'There were no vegetables in the beginning. Only later spinach as I knew it was introduced here. And even later eggplants, red peppers, all kinds of vegetables came to Germany. On the market, merchants handed out recipes: eggplants are cooked this way, zucchini are prepared like this – so that the Germans knew how to prepare all this.'[lxxvii]

Since some of the ingredients needed for cooking an "exotic" dish were not available in Germany or too expensive, recipes often suggested substitutes. In 1953, the first Chinese dish, 'Nasi-Goreng', is recommended in *Die kluge Hausfrau*, followed by 'Schweinefleisch süßsauer (chinesisch)' (pork sweet and sour (Chinese)) which consisted of diced ham, ketchup und canned pineapple.[lxxviii] By using familiar ingredients and tastes, these "exotic" dishes became assimilated to the German palate, producing a hybrid dish which is neither purely Chinese nor purely German. Instead, transnational food migration transgresses these clear-cut boundaries.

An analysis of cookbooks of the 20th century demonstrates that on the one hand there had been a tradition of "international cooking" predating the advent of a considerable number of ethnic restaurants in Germany. Many cookbooks had, for example, a recipe for 'Hammelpilaw', i.e. pilaf, a rice dish, with mutton,[lxxix] long before Turkish restaurants and snack-bars were established in German cities. On the other hand, the spread of eateries offering "foreign" cuisine fostered the popularity of recipes for "exotic" dishes:

'By now, *China-Restaurants* are to be found in many cities in Germany. In some cities there are even a number of them. This way, over the years, a wide circle of people have learnt about the diversity and tastiness of the Chinese cuisine. Therefore, it is understandable that now one wants to eat Chinese at home, too.'[lxxx]

Since the 1960s, not only cookbooks on "international specialties", but a new genre of cookery books dedicated to only one specific "foreign" cuisine started to proliferate.[lxxxi] The public and private consumption of ethnic food added to each other's success, in both spheres an internationalization or, to be more precise, a transnationalization and hybridization of food consumption has taken place. Therefore, redefinitions of taste in post-war Germany were initiated not only by migrant restaurateurs, but also by (German) housewives[lxxxii] who were key players in these transformation processes as they were situated at the interface of public and private consumption.

Like in the US, in Germany the 1960s brought forth a new interest in cooking. Cooking, and cooking "adventurously" in particular,[lxxxiii] became a status symbol in

the 1970s, attracting many middle- and upper-middle class people some of whom were or had been part of the counterculture or New Left.[lxxxiv] These 'most-travelled', 'best-read' and 'most discerning' consumers[lxxxv] searched for new ways of social distinction and self-expression; cooking and food consumption in general were considered appropriate means to find and demonstrate one's place in society – not only for women, but also for men. By this group of consumers, convenience food was increasingly viewed as unhealthy[lxxxvi] and as embodiment of capitalist alienation. A revival of "traditional" forms of production was propagated. Besides cooking at home, the small ethnic restaurant around the corner became a place where many guests hoped to escape mass production and processed food. Today's Slow-Food movement, reacting to processes of global standardization, is part of this tradition of criticism of mass production and consumerism, epitomized in the fast-food industries.

4. Food and Identities

Whereas consumerism in general plays a fundamental role in processes of social distinction and self-expression, this holds particularly true for food. Eating is an incorporation of what is considered as "the (kn)own" and "the other" and thus functions as a primal means of producing ethnic identities. With the availability of ethnic foods greatly increased in the 1960s, images of "exotic" foodstuffs and narrations about their origin started to proliferate widely in the public. For a cultural biography[lxxxvii] of specific ethnic foods, not only the commodity-specific characteristics have to be considered, but also the changes of cultural meanings over time and with regard to different social contexts.[lxxxviii]

In their descriptions of the cuisine offered in an ethnic restaurant, restaurant guide books, which have proliferated massively in the last few decades,[lxxxix] often refer to imaginary places, untouched by modern Western civilization. The ethnic restaurant is represented as part of a foreign country. The tavern *Fidias* in Leverkusen, e.g., is described as a 'Stück Klein-Griechenland' (bit of little Greece), as an 'Erinnerung vielleicht an schöne Urlaubstage in der Ägäis' (recollection of a lovely vacation at the Aegean Sea).[xc] Authenticity and genuineness are the two central attributes with which restaurateurs choose to characterize their restaurants and dishes. Advertisements on the occasion of the opening or re-opening of a restaurant almost always use phrases like 'authentic specialities from the Balkans' ('echte Balkanspezialitäten')[xci] or 'genuine Greek cuisine' ('Original griechische Küche').[xcii]

An ethnic restaurant is viewed as authentic, offering "genuine" dishes, when it is not only frequented by Germans, but also by co-nationals of the restaurateur. Together with the staff and the decoration and furniture, these guests are considered as guaranty for the authenticity of the food served. The material dimensions of the place as well as the social interactions between patrons and staff point to the performative aspect of ascribed ethnicity. The ethnic restaurant can be conceptualized as a theatrical space with the kitchen as backstage area and the dining-hall as center stage where a certain ethnic performance is expected and practiced, by both sides, whether intended or not. An exceptionally complex ethnic performance takes place when, e.g., a pizzeria is managed by Turks.[xciii] Ethnic drag and ethnic passing are here going hand in hand, making visible the mechanisms of "normal" ethnic performances.

These ethnic performances are highly political acts, but rarely viewed as such. In the following I will discuss an example for an overt, explicit political use of an ethnicized food item in contemporary Germany: the *Döner Kebab*. The doner kebab (in short: "the Döner") is the most successful fast food in Germany today, selling better than hamburgers.[xciv] The doner kebap as it is eaten in Germany is a Berlin invention.[xcv] It consists of lamb or beef, salad and *pide*, a bread that is associated with Ramadan in Turkey, but lost this meaning for German Turks when it became an essential part of the doner kebap. Consisting of imported and not-imported ingredients which are combined in a new way formerly not known in Turkey, it is an entirely transnational food item[xcvi] which was not only produced for co-nationals, but very soon also for the so-called open market.

It is important to stress that in the process of commodification of the doner kebab, no pre-existing ethnicity is simply reproduced. Instead, a specific German Turkishness is invented, transcending the conceptions of "Turks in Germany" and engraving new significations on the social landscape. In this sense, I would argue that the production and consumption of ethnic food is always involved in actual representational politics. Whereas the doner kebab functions as a 'positive symbol in multiculturalist discourses',[xcvii] it is also used for debasing (German) Turkish culture. Specific ethnic food items – and most of the time a national cuisine is reduced to one or two well-known dishes**[xcviii]** – can be used for symbolic battles over social positions. A slogan like 'Bockwurst statt Döner' (bockwurst instead of doner kebab), printed on sweatshirts worn by Neo-Nazis, expresses the refusal of "the Turkish" and/or the hybridization of "the German" and thus exemplifies the paranoid discussions on

the incommensurability of the two cultures.[xcix] According to this logic, the supposedly original *Bockwurst* has to replace the "foreign" doner kebab, it's either-or, both foods standing in for strongly defined we- and they-images.[c] Without historical narratives, without biographies of the food items, the slogan is incomprehensible. Furthermore, the word *statt* (instead), i.e. "in the place of", evokes the question of placing and re-placing, referring to spatial politics and addressing the issue of appropriation of real as well as imaginary geographies, thereby pointing to their inseparability.

The attacks on Turkish snack-bars in Germany or, similarly, on Asian food stores in the UK are the more violent outcome of these racist attempts of replacement, indicating the strong identification of a migrant group with "its" food. As the example of the doner kebab demonstrates, ethnic food is intrinsically involved in contemporary discourses on ethnic identities and serves undoubtedly as a 'powerful metonym for national cultures'[ci] as well as a 'source of racial stereotyping'.[cii] Though, of course, it is also "ethnic business" in general that is under attack here, but the restaurant or snack-bar form the most or sometimes only visible 'institutional embodiment of cultural difference'.[ciii]

Conclusion

An analysis of the various discourses and practices dealing with ethnic food in Germany, including eating out at ethnic restaurants as well as ethnic cooking at home,[civ] can help to approach the question what the consumption of "foreign" food means concerning the reconfiguration of German society and its relation to "the other" after 1945. Although in this respect there exist German specifics, the spread of ethnic food in West Germany is part of an international trend in Western consumer cultures.

When eating ethnic food is understood as a 'way of making some kind of declaration'[cv] the question is: what kind of declaration is it? Interpretations vary from viewing the consumption of the foods of different migrant groups as symbolizing 'the acceptance of each group and its culture'[cvi] to considering it as a way of learning 'some minimal lessons in cultural relativity'[cvii] to criticizing all too optimistic accounts by stressing the fact that "consuming the other" (respectively the phantasmatic constructions of "the other") has historically often been linked to exploitation. Commodifying and consuming "the other" is an ambiguous process open to resignifications of various kinds. In the ethnic restaurant, I would argue, the co-existence of a consumerist, more or less peaceful multiculturalism and the

persistence of racist traditions can be observed, a nexus symptomatic for the handling of cultural differences in Germany after 1945.

In the post-war German context, eating out in ethnic restaurants might have been instilled by the desire to become cosmopolitan, to internationalize German identity after 1945. After years of exclusion from global (consumer) culture during the Nazi period, at least during the Second World War, many Germans wished to again participate in a Western life-style for which eating out became more and more important.[cviii] Furthermore, it seems to be no coincidence that, as Dieter Richter has pointed out, ethnic cuisine had its breakthrough in West Germany in the late 60s and 70s – not only because of the growing number of immigrants opening up restaurants and snack-bars, for the first time enabling consumers in many parts of Germany to try ethnic food. Furthermore, the newly available supply was met by a generation of (young) consumers looking for political, but also culinary alternatives. Whereas the left-wing songwriter Franz-Josef Degenhardt in his song 'German Sunday' (*Deutscher Sonntag*) saw German cuisine characterized by the 'Blubbern dicker Soßen' (the bubbling of thick sauces) and thus as immobile, bourgeois, narrow-minded and, in a sense, as fascist, the Italian cuisine in particular seemed to offer a modern, light and healthy food option.[cix] For the alternative milieus the left-wing "Italian around the corner," but also the "left-wing Greek" escaped from the military regime in Greece (later on also the persecuted "Turk" or "Kurd") represented popular meeting places, not least to demonstrate international solidarity by one's consumer choices.[cx]

It is not only political opinion, but also class, ethnic and gender differences which are articulated in the act of eating out. This takes place in sometimes conflicting ways, suggesting that food consumption practices are precariously flexible markers of identity.[cxi] Tracing the transnational consumption in ethnic restaurants and at home is, of course, but one arena for discussing ethnic identities in West Germany. The omnipresence of ethnic food, however, makes it an ideal object for studying the re-negotiations of cultural differences in everyday life. It brings to the foreground the complex processes of glocalization which transnational food migration entails. In this sense, food, and ethnic food in particular, functions as a lens for understanding global processes. What is especially interesting about food in this context is its connection with the body. Eating is about boundaries being transgressed, about something from the outside taken inside, and maybe it is this corporeal dimension which makes food such a powerful symbol in struggles over places and territories, over social and personal identities. Food is materially

incorporated and therefore possesses a complexity not shared by (all) other consumer goods.

 S. Köhler, *Internationalisierung der Verzehrsgewohnheiten in ausgewählten europäischen Ländern* (Frankfurt/M., 1993), p. 12.

ii E. Barlösius, *Soziologie des Essens: Eine sozial- und kulturwissenschaftliche Einführung in die Ernährungsforschung* (Weinheim, 1999), p. 147.

iii U. Spiekermann, 'Europas Küchen: Eine Annäherung', *Mitteilungen des Internationalen Arbeitskreises für Kulturforschung des Essens*, 5 (2000), p. 31. See also U. Spiekermann, 'Deutsche Küche – Eine Fiktion: Regionale Verzehrsgewohnheiten im 20. Jahrhundert', in K. Gedrich, U. Oltersdorf (eds), *Ernährung und Raum: Regionale und ethnische Ernährungsweisen in Deutschland* (Karlsruhe, 2002), pp. 47-73.

iv G. Ritzer, *The McDonaldization of Society: An Investigation into the Changing Character of Contemporary Social Life* (Thousand Oaks, 1993).

v R. Robertson, 'Glocalization: Time-Space and Homogeneity-Heterogeneity', in M. Featherstone, S. Lash, R. Robertson (eds), *Global Modernities* (London, 1995), pp. 25-44.

vi For a case study on the entanglement of local food and cuisine with global food trade see R. Wilk in this volume.

vii H. Diner, *Hungering for America: Italian, Irish, and Jewish Foodways in the Age of Migration* (Cambridge, MA, 2001), p. 8.

viii H.-J. Teuteberg, 'The Rising Popularity of Dining Out in German Restaurants in the Aftermath of Modern Urbanization', in M. Jacobs, P. Scholliers (eds), *Eating Out in Europe: Picnics, Gourmet Dining and Snacks since the Late Eighteenth Century* (Oxford, 2003), p. 284. In pre-modern times, eating out did not form part of the experience of a considerable number of people, and the inns providing food for travellers did not offer a range of dishes to choose from.

ix R. L. Spang, *The Invention of the Restaurant: Paris and Modern Gastronomic Culture* (Cambridge, MA, 2000).

x C. Drummer, 'Das sich ausbreitende Restaurant in deutschen Großstädten als Ausdruck bürgerlichen Repräsentationsstrebens 1870-1930', in H.-J. Teuteberg, G. Neumann (eds), *Essen und kulturelle Identität: Europäische Perspektiven* (Berlin, 1997), p. 304. The German term *Restaurant*, borrowed from the French in the second half of the 19th century, at first only referred to the highest level of cuisine, but today comprises more or less all eateries where you can have your meal at a table; it is used synonymous to *Gaststätte* (Teuteberg, 'Rising Popularity', p. 281). On the history of gastronomy in Germany see A. Jenn, *Die deutsche Gastronomie: Eine historische und betriebswissenschaftliche Betrachtung* (Frankfurt/M., 1993).

xi Teuteberg, 'Rising Popularity', p. 283.

xii K.R. Allen, *Hungrige Metropole: Essen, Wohlfahrt und Kommerz in Berlin* (Hamburg, 2002), p. 13.

xiii K. Gedrich, M. Albrecht, *Datenrecherche der Entwicklung der Haushaltsausgaben für Ernährung in der zweiten Hälfte des 20. Jahrhunderts* (Freising-Weihenstephan, 2003)(Materialienband Nr. 3), p. 48.

xiv Ibid., p. 49.

xv Ibid., p. 80, table 11.

xvi Teuteberg, 'Rising Popularity', p. 281.

xvii D.J. Oddy, 'Eating without Effort: The Rise of the Fast-Food Industry in Twentieth-Century Britain', in Jacobs, Scholliers, *Eating Out*, p. 309.

[xviii] V. Amilien, 'The Rise of Restaurants in Norway in the Twentieth Century', in Jacobs, Scholliers, *Eating Out*, p.185. In the UK, the percentages of people eating out weekly or monthly are double the Norwegian figures.

[xix] Yet, the general increase in eating out cannot be attributed to rising incomes alone, it is also the spread of non-luxurious eateries that has enabled a growing proportion of Europeans to go out for lunch or dinner. For the Netherlands, Adri Albert de la Bruhèze and Anneke H. van Otterloo have emphasized this aspect (A. Albert de la Bruhèze, A. H. van Otterloo, 'Snacks and Snack Culture in the Netherlands', in Jacobs, Scholliers, *Eating Out*, p. 330).

[xx] Amilien, 'Rise of Restaurants', p. 186.

[xxi] Research undertaken in the UK suggests that students and other highly educated social groups form the largest part of the patrons of ethnic restaurants. Cf. A. Warde, L. Martens, *Eating Out: Social Differentiation, Consumption and Pleasure* (Cambridge, 2000). For a discussion of the restaurant as a predominantly urban phenomenon see D. Bell, G. Valentine, *Consuming Geographies: We are where we eat* (London, 1997)

[xxii] Zentrale Markt- und Preisberichtstelle für Erzeugnisse der Land-, Forst- und Ernährungswirtschaft (ZMP) (ed), *Essen außer Haus 2000* (Bonn 2001), p. 22. Women go to foreign restaurants more frequently than men.

[xxiii] W. Zelinsky, 'You Are Where You Eat', in B. G. Shortridge, J. R. Shortridge (eds), *The Taste of American Place: A Reader on Regional and Ethnic Food* (Lanham, MD, 1998), p. 243.

[xxiv] A. Basu, 'Immigrant Entrepreneurs in the Food Sector: Breaking the Mould', in A. J. Kershen, *Food in the Migrant Experience* (Aldershot, 2002), p. 149f.

[xxv] Whereas in 1999 in London 90 grams of ethnic foods were eaten per week, only 17 grams were consumed in Yorkshire (Oddy, 'Eating without Effort', p. 310). In the Netherlands, it is Chinese-Indonesian food that is eaten much more frequently than other types of foreign cuisine (de la Bruhèze, van Otterloo, 'Snacks', p. 328, table 19.3).

[xxvi] S. Peckham, 'Consuming nations', in S. Griffith, J. Wallace (eds), *Consuming Passions: Food in the age of anxiety* (Manchester, 1998), p. 172.

[xxvii] J. Finkelstein, *Dining Out: A Sociology of Modern Manners* (New York, 1989), p. 3.

[xxviii] For the German case, statistical data on travelling abroad, especially to Italy, and the growing market for Italian restaurants in the 1960s seems to confirm the correlation of travelling and eating out in an ethnic restaurant, thereby stressing the moment of movement and transfer which was and is not unidirectional. For a history of post-war German tourism see C. Pagenstecher, *Der bundesdeutsche Tourismus, Ansätze zu einer Visual History: Urlaubsprospekte, Reiseführer, Fotoalben 1950-1990* (Hamburg, 2003).

[xxix] In almost all accounts on ethnic restaurants in Germany the good prizes are mentioned. Cf. 'Neues italienisches Restaurant eröffnet', *Lokale Informationen (Lev)*, 7.2.90. Also in Britain, ethnic restaurants 'mostly catered for the less expensive end of the market' (S. Mennell, *All Manners of Food: Eating and Taste in England and France from the Middle Ages to the Present* (Urbana, Ill., 2nd edn, 1996), p. 326).

[xxx] Zelinsky, 'You Are Where You Eat', p. 246. I follow this definition in so far as telephone directories represent an essential part of my source material for reconstructing when and where ethnic restaurants were established in Germany.

[xxxi] 'Sie sprechen deutsch und kochen ausländisch (aber auch bürgerlich)' (W. Dipp, 'Türken und Thais rühren im Kochtopf: Ein Jugoslawe fühlt sich als Rheinländer', *Leverkusener Anzeiger*, 8.7.1980).

xxxii Furthermore, already fused dishes were imported into Germany, like 'Mulligatawny-Suppe' which was classified as coming from India and England; its biography is described as a 'sort of soup-odyssee' (R. Gööck, *Die 100 berühmtesten Rezepte der Welt: Das Farbbild-Kochbuch der internationalen Spezialitäten* (Bonn, 1971), p. 55).

xxxiii K. Ray, *The Migrant's Table: Meals and Memories in Bengali-American Households* (Philadelphia, PA, 2004), p. 6.

xxxiv 'They may occupy its spaces momentarily (during the consumption of a meal, for example) or for a lifetime (as members of ethnically defined transnational communities)' (P. Jackson, P. Crang, C. Dwyer, 'Introduction: the Spaces of Transnationality', in P. Jackson, P. Crang, C. Dwyer (eds), *Transnational Spaces* (London, 2004), p. 3).

xxxv In this sense, national cuisines are the result of intercultural encounters (D. Richter, 'Reisen und Schmecken: Wie die Deutschen gelernt haben, italienisch zu essen', *Voyage. Jahrbuch für Reise- und Tourismusforschung*, 2002, p. 25).

xxxvi In 1984, the *Associazione Verace Pizza Napoletana* was founded. In their charter rules for baking an "authentic" pizza are formulated ('Die Pizza als Weltkulturerbe? Interview with Antonio Pace, president of the Associazione Verace Pizza Napoletana', *Voyage*, 2002, pp. 89-95).

xxxvii Personal conversation with Mr. S., 02/08/2006, in Leverkusen.

xxxviii See J. Morris on the cheap and cheerful cuisine of the early Italian restaurant chains in the UK (in this volume). On the Italian restaurant business in Germany see E. Pichler, *Migration, Community-Formierung und ethnische Ökonomie: Die italienischen Gewerbetreibenden in Berlin* (Berlin, 1997).

xxxix Allen, *Hungrige Metropole*, p. 108

xl L. Amenda, *Fremde – Hafen – Stadt: Chinesische Migration und ihre Wahrnehmung in Hamburg 1897-1972* (München, 2006), p. 323.

xli Still today (in 2000), the Italian cuisine is the most popular in Germany. When eating out in foreign restaurants, 40 per cent choose Italian restaurants or pizzerias and another 16,4 per cent go to Greek restaurants (ZMP, *Essen außer Haus 2000*, p. 25).

xlii P. Bernhard: 'L'Italia nel piatto. Per una storia della cucina e della gastronomia italiane in Germania nel XX secolo', in G. Corni, C. Dipper (eds), *Italiani in Germania tra Ottocento e Novecento: Spostamenti, rapporti, immagini, influenze* (Bologna, 2006), p. 264.

xliii Ibid., p. 271.

xliv A comprehensive account of the history of the *Anwerbestopp* (recruitment stop) is given by U. Herbert, *Geschichte der Ausländerpolitik in Deutschland: Saisonarbeiter, Zwangsarbeiter, Gastarbeiter, Flüchtlinge* (München, 2001), pp. 223ff.

xlv Jenn, *Die deutsche Gastronomie*, p. 70.

xlvi H.H. Grimm, *Das Gastgewerbe in der Bundesrepublik* (dpa Hintergrund; Nr. 3245, 21.7.1987), p. 11. In marked contrast to Germany and Britain, ethnic cuisines 'made fewer inroads among restaurants in France' (Mennell, *All Manners of Food*, p. 330).

xlvii H.D. von Löffelholz, A. Gieseck, H. Buch, *Ausländische Selbständige in der Bundesrepublik Deutschland: Unter besonderer Berücksichtigung von Entwicklungsperspektiven in den neuen Bundesländern* (Berlin, 1994), p. 78 and pp. 45f. Whereas until the 1970s Italians constituted the largest segment of migrants in West Germany, the Turkish population forms the biggest group since 1971.

xlviii World-wide, approximately 60.000 Italian restaurants exist (R. Wachter, 'Bella Italia', *Hessische Gastronomie. Fachmagazin für die Hotellerie und Gastronomie*, 12 (2003), p. 19).

xlix Greven's Kölner Adreßbücher (Cologne address books), 1955, 1960, 1968 and 1973.

l In 1980, 70 of the 570 restaurants were run by migrants, i.e. a little more than 12 per cent ('Ausländer zieht's hinter die Theke: Jeder achte Wirt spricht eine fremde Sprache', *Leverkusener Anzeiger*, 4.7.1980). 18,7 per cent go to Asian restaurants when eating in ausl. Spez. (ZMP, *Essen außer Haus 2000*, p. 25).

li Amenda, *Fremde*, p. 340. See also endnote 91 for the similar term *Balkan-Grill*.

lii In the early 1950s, outside of London, a restaurant devoted to a non-European cuisine was 'almost wholly unfamiliar' (C. Driver, *The British at the Table, 1940-1980* (London, 1983), p. 74) – with the exception of the already mentioned Chinese restaurants in seaports like Hamburg.

liii Rheinisch-Westfälisches Wirtschaftsarchiv, Cologne, Gaststättengewerbe – Allgemeines, Bd.1: 1945-1952 (Abt. 1, Nr. 176, Fasz. 3) [53], *Kölner Hof* to Dr. Rüther, Chamber of Commerce in Cologne, 04/07/1951.

liv H. Mai, 'Furcht vor zu vielen fremden Gastwirten: Leverkusener Gastronomen an getrennten Tischen', *Kölnische Rundschau (Lev)*, 03/24/1977.

lv 'Grieche baut Restaurant: Anwohner protestieren', *Leverkusener Anzeiger*, 05/04/1992.

lvi D. Schmidt, 'Unternehmertum und Ethnizität – ein seltsames Paar', *Prokla: Zeitschrift für kritische Sozialwissenschaft*, 30/3 (2000), p. 339.

lvii Only after eight or, if you were married to a German national, after five years migrants had the chance to get an unlimited residence permit. Since the 1980s, this regulation has not been a major problem, because in most cases at least one member of a migrant family has resided in Germany for more than 5 years (J. Blaschke, A. Ersöz, 'The Turkish Economy in West Berlin', *International Small Business Journal*, 4/3 (1985), p. 40).

lviii Löffelholz, Gieseck, Buch, *Ausländische Selbständige*, p. 51.

lix Basu, 'Immigrant Entrepreneurs', p. 152.

lx It is this labor-intensity in catering work that makes David Parker call into question the idea of time-space compression in the age of globalization, drawing attention to differing perspectives by discussing the example of fast food – time-saving for the consumers, but implying the surrendering of a lot of time on the side of those selling fast food all day and even at night (D. Parker, 'The Chinese Takeaway and the Diasporic Habitus: Space, Time and Power Geometries', in B. Hesse (ed), *Un/Settled Multiculturalisms: Disaporas, Entanglements, 'Transruptions'* (London, 2000), p. 89f.).

lxi F. Hillmann, 'Ethnische Ökonomien als Schnittpunkte von Migrationssystem und Arbeitsmarkt in Berlin', *Prokla*, 30/3 (2000), p. 417.

lxii Ibid. These features apply to businesses run by first-generation male entrepreneurs in particular; generational and gender differences are of utmost importance in this context (F. Hillmann, *Türkische Unternehmerinnen und Beschäftigte im Berliner ethnischen Gewerbe* (FS I 98-107, discussion paper, Dec. 1998)).

lxiii Blaschke, Ersöz, 'Turkish Economy', p. 41.

lxiv Schmidt, 'Unternehmertum', p. 352.

lxv I prefer the term nationality to ethnicity which, in the German context, connotes bloodline descent and is more or less a substitute for "race", a term that has more or less been extinguished from public discourse after 1945.

lxvi Wachter, 'Bella Italia', 20. According to a survey undertaken by the *Allensbach-Institut*, of the young people under 30 years of age, even 65 per cent prefer Italian restaurants (R. Lücke, 'Für die italienischen Momente im Leben, Pizza, Pasta, Parma-Schinken: Vor 50 Jahren kam La Dolce vita nach Deutschland – und mit ihm eine neue Esskultur', *Welt am Sonntag*, 01/16/2005). Similarly, in the Netherlands Italian

restaurants by far outsell other Mediterranean restaurants, such as Yugoslavian and Spanish (A. van Otterloo, 'Foreign Immigrants and the Dutch at the Table, 1945-1985: Bridging or Widening the Gap?', *The Netherlands Journal of Sociology*, 23 (2) (1987), p. 132).

lxvii Sales figures of Italian pasta in Germany almost doubled in the last five years – the Netherlands, France and Germany being the three biggest importers of Italian food (Lücke, 'Für die italienischen Momente'). For the history of Italian food imports to Germany see Bernhard, 'L'Italia nel piatto'.

lxviii Patrick Bernhard speaks of 'l'autoitalianizzazione' in this context (Bernhard, 'L'Italia nel piatto', p. 279).

lxix M. Wildt, *Vom kleinen Wohlstand: Eine Konsumgeschichte der fünfziger Jahre* (Frankfurt/M., 1996), p. 144.

lxx Ibid.

lxxi Ibid., p. 145.

lxxii Ibid., p. 177.

lxxiii M. Blasche, *Das kleine Kochbuch für Schülerinnen, Lehrlinge und junge Hausfrauen* (Hiltrup, 4th edn, 1950), p. 52.

lxxiv E. Schuler, *Mein Kochbuch: Über tausend Rezepte für die einfache und feine Küche* (Stuttgart, 6th edn, 1949), p. 209. For an early example of a German compilation of Italian recipes see 'Italienische Spezialgerichte', *Frauen-Genossenschafts-Blatt*, 3 (1904).

lxxv Wildt, *Vom kleinen* Wohlstand, pp. 184f.

lxxvi Within the daily meal cycle, marginal meals like breakfast in Western societies are more prone to change.

lxxvii 'In Deutschland nannten sie mich Ayse: Die Tellerwäscherin Bedriye Furtina', in M. Richter, *gekommen und geblieben: Deutsch-türkische Lebensgeschichten* (Hamburg, 2003), p. 126: 'Gemüse gab es am Anfang nicht. Erst später kam Spinat hierher, so wie ich ihn kannte. Und noch später kamen Auberginen, Paprika, alle Arten von Gemüse nach Deutschland. Auf dem Markt verteilten die Händler damals Rezepte: Auberginen werden so gekocht, Zucchini so zubereitet – damit die Deutschen wussten, wie man alles zubereitete.'

lxxviii Wildt, *Wohlstand*, pp. 188f. Nasi goreng soon became, similar to ravioli, one of the most popular canned dishes. – In the Netherlands popular woman's magazines started to publish the first Chinese-Indonesian recipes in 1950 (Otterloo, 'Foreign Immigrants', p. 131), i.e. just after Indonesia's independence.

lxxix Blasche, *Das kleine Kochbuch*, p. 33.

lxxx 'China-Restaurants sind heute bereits in vielen Städten Deutschlands anzutreffen. In manchen Städten gibt es sogar eine ganze Reihe. Weite Kreise haben so hier im Laufe der Zeit die Vielfalt und Schmackhaftigkeit der chinesischen Küche schätzen gelernt […]. Es ist daher verständlich, dass man nun zu Hause ebenfalls chinesisch essen möchte' (The Amoy Canning Corporation (ed.), *Rezepte für AMOYCAN Chinesische Leckerbissen* (Hong Kong, 1974), p. 2).

lxxxi Similarly, in the US in the 1950s more and more Americans became interested in "foreign" cuisines and specialty cookbooks made 'significant inroads into the cookbook market' (J. Neuhaus, *Manly Meals and Mom's Home Cooking: Cookbooks and Gender in Modern America* (Baltimore, 2003), p. 165).

lxxxii Implicitly or explicitly, the cookbooks of the 1950s to 1970s mainly addressed middle-class housewives and did not refer to lower-class or migrant women's different experiences.

[lxxxiii] 'Essen als Abenteuer – warum eigentlich nicht?' (Eating as adventure – why not?) asks Horst Schaffenberg in his cookbook *Zu Gast an fremden Feuern: Das KARL-MAY-Kochbuch* (Bamberg, 1975), p. 5.

[lxxxiv] H. Levenstein, *Paradox of Plenty: A Social History of Eating in Modern America* (New York, 1993), p. 217 and p. 219.

[lxxxv] Ibid., p. 219.

[lxxxvi] Changes in food consumption patterns are partly due to the dissemination of nutritional information – an aspect that is beyond the scope of this paper. For the growing distrust in the food industries and their products from the 1960s onwards see Mennell, *All Manners of Food*, p. 340; for a very similar development in the US see W. Belasco, *Appetite for Change: How the Counterculture Took on the Food Industry* (Ithaca, 1993).

[lxxxvii] A. Appandurai, *The Social Life of Things: Commodities in Cultural Perspective* (Cambridge, 1986). For a commodity biography of cappuccino see J. Morris in this volume.

[lxxxviii] Foods in general share, above all, the following traits: variability and transitoriness (A. Zingerle, 'Identitätsbildung bei Tische: Theoretische Vorüberlegungen aus kultursoziologischer Sicht', in Teuteberg, Neumann, *Essen und kulturelle Identität*, p. 69).

[lxxxix] The general proliferation of guidebooks is a response to the enormous variety of consumer goods and the problems to choose from this wide range of available goods. Cf. A. Warde, 'Continuity and Change in British Restaurants, 1951-2001', in Jacobs, Scholliers, *Eating Out*, p. 241.

[xc] H. Schonauer, 'Hermes und Poseidon laden in die antike Taverne: Neues griechisches Lokal mit Ansprüchen', *Rheinische Post (Lev)*, 06/25/1983. In an advertisement of the tavern *Sorbas* in Leverkusen, it is the Mediterranean sea and Greek folklore (men in Greek costumes dancing sirtaki) that stand in for the longing for Hellas and the authenticity of the restaurant ('Sorbas', *Leverkusener Anzeiger*, 08/30/1980).

[xci] Advertisement of the *Zagreb-Grill* in Leverkusen (*Leverkusener Anzeiger*, 06/22/1968). The *Balkan-Grill* was a very popular institution in the 1970s and early 1980s, but has increasingly been under attack in recent years for being "outdated" – Germany's guest-workers' cuisine' (*Gastarbeiterküche*) in general having had its day, according to P. Peter, 'Bye-bye, Balkan-Grill', *Frankfurter Allgemeine Sonntagszeitung*, 01/18/2004.

[xcii] Advertisement of the restaurant *Sorbas* in Leverkusen (*Lokal-Anzeiger*, 09/23/1980).

[xciii] This is a typical situation especially in Eastern Germany, but not only there. Cf. D. Soyez, 'Der "Kölsche Chinese" und andere Hybride: Kölner Restaurants als Bühnen von Glokalisierungsprozessen', *Kölner Geographische Arbeiten*, 82 (2004), p. 32.

[xciv] Hillmann, Rudolph, *Redistributing the cake?*, p. 19.

[xcv] A. Caglar, 'McDoner: Doner Kebap and the Social Positioning Struggle of German Turks', in J. Costa, G. Bamossy (eds), *Marketing in a Multicultural World: Ethnicity, Nationalism, and Cultural Identity* (Thousand Oaks, 1995), pp. 209-230.

[xcvi] I prefer this characterization to conceptualizing the Döner-kebap as a creolized product – the concept of creolization being in danger of reifying the assumption of two pure, distinctive cultures mixing. Cf. I. Cook, P. Crang, 'The World on a Plate: Culinary Culture, Displacement and Geographical Knowledges', *Journal of Material Culture*, 1(2) (1996), pp. 131-153. 'Translocal' might be an even more appropriate term here, since it is not necessarily national contexts, but specific localities (as Berlin) which merge with other localities and produce something new (cf. Maren Möhring, 'TransLokal. Ausländische Gaststätten in der Bundesrepublik Deutschland', *traverse* 41/2 (2007)).

[xcvii] Caglar, 'McDoner', p. 209.

[xcviii] In the case of migrant cuisines, these dishes are often placed at the bottom of the culinary hierarchy. Cf. Barlösius, *Soziologie des Essens*, p. 163.

[xcix] A kind of response to the Nazi slogan is a t-shirt now available in several shops in Germany and via e-bay, promising that 'Döner makes you more beautiful' ('Döner macht schöner').

[c] M. Featherstone, 'Global and local cultures', in J. Bird et al. (eds), *Mapping the Futures: Local Cultures, Global Change* (London, 1993), p. 184.

[ci] Peckham, 'Consuming nations', p. 172. This 'intimate connection between alimentary imagery and national identity' is also stressed by Parker, 'Chinese Takeaway', p. 78.

[cii] A. J. Kershen, 'Introduction: Food in the Migrant Experience', in A. J. Kershen, *Food in the Migrant Experience*, p. 8. In Germany Italians were and are sometimes still called 'Spaghettifresser'.

[ciii] Parker, 'Chinese Takeaway', p. 79. Christina Hardyment speaks of restaurants as 'the most public face of the new communities' (C. Hardyment, *Slice of Life: The British Way of Eating since 1945* (London, 1995), p. 139).

[civ] On both the private and public consumption of cappuccino see J. Morris (in this volume).

[cv] S. W. Mintz, *Tasting Food, Tasting Freedom: Excursions into Eating, Culture, and the Past* (Boston, 1996), p. 13.

[cvi] S. Kalcik, 'Ethnic Foodways in America: Symbol and Performance of Identity', in L. Keller Brown, K. Mussell (eds), *Ethnic and Regional Foodways in the United States: The Performance of Group Identity* (Knoxville, TN, 1984), p. 61.

[cvii] R. Abrahams, 'Equal Opportunity Eating: A Structural Excursus on Things of the Mouth', in Keller Brown, Mussell, *Ethnic and Regional Foodways*, p. 23.

[cviii] 'To be at the leading edge of modern capitalism is to eat fifteen different cuisines in any one week.' (S. Hall, 'The Local and the Global: Globalization and Ethnicity', in A. McClintock, A. Mufti, E. Shohat (eds), *Dangerous Liaisons. Gender, Nation, and Postcolonial Perspectives* (Minneapolis, 1997), p. 181).

[cix] Richter, 'Reisen und Schmecken', p. 27. For the 'stereotype of the healthy other on the shores of the Mediterranean' see A. James, 'How British Is British Food?', in P. Caplan (ed), *Food, Health, and Identity* (London, 1997), p. 73.

[cx] On the "longing for Italy" in the German New Left see S. Sackstetter, 'Vogliamo tutto – Wir wollen alles: Italiensehnsucht der deutschen Linken,' in H. Siebenmorgen (ed.), *Wenn bei Capri die rote Sonne… Die Italiensehnsucht der Deutschen im 20. Jahrhundert* (Karlsruhe, 1997), pp. 124-129.

[cxi] According to Elspeth Probyn, eating is less a confirmation than a questioning of identity; eating, as a process of connecting one's body to others, animate and inanimate, entails becoming different, 'reworking the categories that once defined us' (E. Probyn, *Carnal Appetites: Foodsexidentities* (London, 2000), p. 32).